

PUBLIC RECORD

1. Background

1.1 Comsteel's Application

In its Application pursuant to section 269ZHD(2)(b) of the *Customs Act 1901* (Cth) (Act), Comsteel have alleged that anti-dumping measures should be continued on the basis that:

- a. since the imposition of the anti-dumping measures in 2019, exports to Australia from China have continued, while exports from France have ceased;
- b. due to the common ownership between the relevant producing companies and exporters in both countries, exports from France may resume if measures applying to Goods exported from France, but not China, were discontinued;
- c. Masteel, has continued to supply the Goods from China to Australia;
- d. the Goods exported from China to Australia in the year ending 30 June 2023 were dumped above negligible values, which will likely apply to future exports from China to Australia;
- e. the Steel Industry Profitability data from the CRU Group shows a 20% decline in the profitability and price of steel since 2018 due to the softening domestic demand in China for steel products, resulting in Chinese producers pricing exports at prices intended to secure increased sales volume, which increases the likelihood of exporting at dumped prices;
- f. if the anti-dumping measures were to expire, the Australian industry will experience a recurrence of material injury; and
- g. Comsteel continues to experience price pressures in 2023 from dumped exports from China, resulting in unsuccessful tender supply outcomes and lost sales volumes.

BHP understand that Comsteel have relied on information from the maintenance of distribution links, the value of exports of Goods from China and France, customer feedback and their own estimates of current export prices and normal values.

1.2 Commissioner's Consideration

In the *Anti-Dumping Commission Report No 466* (REP 466) dated 16 June 2019 (Original Investigation), the Minister for Industry and Science (Minister) decided to accept Comsteel's application pursuant to the initially imposed public notice.

In response to Comsteel's Application to extend the anti-dumping measures, the Commissioner has taken the following considerations from the period between 1 July 2022 to 30 June 2023 in determining whether dumping has occurred (Inquiry Period):

- a. information outlined in the Original Investigation, whereby the Commissioner found that procurement decisions made by the purchasers of Goods were predominantly based on price (Ground 1).
- b. information obtained from the Australian Border Force (ABF) import data base from REP 466, whereby the Commissioner noted:
 - i. exporters from China have continued to export Goods to Australia in substantial volumes since the imposition of the anti-dumping measures in 2019, which confirms that manufacturers in China have maintained distribution links into the Australian market;
 - ii. it is likely that the export of Goods to Australia from France ceased following the imposition of securities in 2018 (and subsequently the rate of dumping duty) on the basis that the rate imposed on those Goods were considerably higher than the rate imposed on Goods exported from China; and
 - iii. accordingly, there appear to be reasonable grounds to support Comsteel's assertion that exports from France may resume if the measures expire (Ground 2).
- c. financial information provided by Comsteel (including their own estimations), whereby the Commissioner noted:

PUBLIC RECORD

managing ore car wheel quality. Regrettably, since the implementation of measures in 2019, xxxxxxxxxxxx
xx, thereby negatively impacting
their operations and the Australian industry at large. The substantial and potentially fatal risks associated
with subpar ore car wheel quality necessitate steadfast diligence from both BHP and its suppliers. Thus, so
as to maintain impeccable safety and operational standards, BHP will continue to align its procurement
practices with suppliers that demonstrably adhere to the highest quality and safety norms, ensuring a
fortified alignment with BHP's stringent and uncompromising standards.

The genuine source of material injury, if there be any, can be sourced to the Goods' performance issues,
not economic factors such as price. xx
xx
xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx.

In the alternative, if the Commissioner is satisfied that the expiry of the measures would lead to material
injury, the Commissioner should find that the Goods manufactured by Comsteel are not "like goods" to
those purchased by BHP from Masteel due to the material differences in qualitative characteristics.¹

Goods that carry significant repercussions if not safely manufactured ought to carry legislative management
on safety. This will incentivise local suppliers to produce high quality goods, and no anti-dumping measures
should be in place unless and until this definition has been met.

(b) Historical Safety Opinions

BHP has an approximate 30-year history of engaging Comsteel for the supply of Goods. During this period,
BHP continuously found defects in the Goods, which consequently led to strenuous management to
mitigate safety risks. BHP sought an independent review on the defective Comsteel Goods from xxxxxx in
2006 (xx), who provided two reports dated 31 July
2006:

- "Examination of an Ore Car Wheel – xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx" (First Report); and
- "Examination of an Ore Car Wheel – xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx" (Second Report).

The First Report found "relatively extensive fatigue cracking" within the Goods
(xx).

The Second Report found two areas of cracking across the rim face of an ore car wheel. Following a
sectioning of the ore car wheel, considerable additional cracking was found through the rim (xxxxxxxxxxxxx
xx).

xx:

xx
xx
xx
xx
xx

Based on the past performance of Comsteel supplied Goods, as well as the subsequent metallurgical
analysis (which revealed increasing steel inclusions with increasing depth), BHP considers it highly unlikely
that Comsteel's Goods can successfully meet BHP's current specification, unless there is significant
improvement in Comsteel's manufacturing process to improve quality.

xx
xx
As a result, BHP ceased purchasing Goods from Comsteel
as it posed a safety risk to BHP's personnel, as well as a risk of derailment. As explained above BHP has had
to implement costly controls and monitoring procedures for those Comsteel Goods which are still on BHP's
rail network because of the inferior quality of Comsteel's Goods. As a direct result of these controls

¹ As outlined in the Anti-Dumping Commission "Dumping and Subsidiary Manual" dated December 2021 at p. 10 – 11, where goods are not
alike in all respects, it is open to the Commission to consider whether the goods have characteristics closely resembling each other, including
grade, standards and quality, for the purpose of determining whether the two goods are "like goods".

PUBLIC RECORD

implemented by BHP, BHP have not experienced any incidents which have posed a safety risk to BHP’s personnel.

It is important to note that since BHP ceased purchasing Goods from Comsteel in 2019, there have been no reported quality concerns or incidents with any of the alternative Goods suppliers notwithstanding the absence of additional controls.

XX
XX
XX
XX
XX
XX
XX

The below table is a summary of instances reported involving defective Comsteel Goods from 2016 to 2018:

Table with 5 columns: #, Date, Manufacturer, Wheel Diameter, Key findings. It contains 8 rows of data, each with placeholder text (XXXXXX).

As stated above, there have been no incidents involving Comsteel Goods since 2018. However, this is because of the additional controls implemented by BHP to manage safety risks. In addition to these safety risks, the shorter lifespan of Comsteel’s Goods resulting from their inadequate quality means they will need to be replaced more frequently, which poses a significant cost to BHP.

Comsteel has alleged in their Application, and the Commissioner found in the ADC Report in 2019, that during an ore car wheel tender process conducted in late 2016, the successful supplier was chosen on price alone. BHP disputes this allegation and finding on the basis that it is purely speculative, which is evident from the fact that there have been no reports of poor quality ore car wheels from other suppliers . BHP’s evaluation criteria in rail tenders are weighted heavily on safety, xx
xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx. If all tenderers meet the safety requirements pursuant to the criteria, the final considerations as part of BHP’s selection process include decarbonisation, local/Indigenous value and price.

XX
XX
XX

XX
XX
XX. The anti-dumping measures have had a counter-intuitive effect as they simply result in Australian’ users such as BHP to purchase foreign manufactured goods at higher prices.

Notwithstanding Comsteel’s ongoing engagement with BHP for the supply of a different product to the Goods, being Loco wheels and axels for use in BHP’s network,² xx
xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx. Comsteel are familiar with BHP’s network, the importance of safety and that it was ultimately the inadequate quality of their Goods that resulted in BHP’s decision to cease purchasing their Goods (as addressed in BHP’s submissions to the Original Investigation). However, in their Application pursuant to this Notice, Comsteel have not addressed BHP’s prior raised concerns with

² BHP have determined that these products supplied by Comsteel are of adequate quality.

PUBLIC RECORD

XXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXX	XXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXX	XXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXX
XXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXX	XXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXX	
XXXXXXX	XXXXXXX	XXXXXX

Table 1.2: XXX

	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022
Revenue (in mn RMB)	2,033	2,867	2,056	2,155	2,523
Rev/tonne	92	127	99	103	107
Change in Revenue		38%	-22%	3%	4%
Cost of goods sold (COGS)	2,042	2,580	1,716	1,819	2,143
COGS/tonne	93	115	83	87	91
change in COGS		24%	-28%	4%	5%

Table 1.3: Masteel's financial report for 2018 – 2022

The above analysis is also supported by BHP's import prices (see Diagram 1 & 2).



XX



XX

PUBLIC RECORD

BHP would be pleased to provide any additional information or documents which the ADC requires to clarify or support any of the matters outlined above.

Yours sincerely

BHP